



October 8, 1999

TO: CSR Staff

FROM: Office of Program Coordination CSR

SUBJECT: **CSR Policy Statement 99-14: Program Project Review**

Background: The Scientific Review Administrators (SRAs) have asked for clarification of the review of Program Projects (P01s) and appropriate scoring procedures. It is standard practice that all individual research projects (but not cores) within a P01 are individually scored, and that an overall score is also assigned to the entire project. In addition, a review committee has the option of recommending removal of a poor individual project. However, if one or more of the individual projects receives a poor score and is removed, should the removed project(s) influence the overall score? That is, should the overall score reflect the scientific merit of all the projects including the removed poor project(s), or should the score reflect the merit of the remaining projects after removal of the poor project(s)? Some review groups have considered the inclusion of a poor project to reflect adversely on the administrative abilities (and perhaps scientific judgment) of the Principal Investigator and, accordingly, have assigned a score reflecting the merit of all projects, including the removed poor project. The Director of the Office of Extramural Programs, Office of Extramural Research, Office of the Director, NIH, has informed us that there is no NIH-wide policy for scoring P01s after removal of a poor project, and that each Institute has its own policy.

Policy: In determining the overall scoring procedure for a P01 where one or more poor projects have been recommended for removal, the CSR review committee will abide by the policy of the Institute to which the application has been assigned for funding. The SRA in charge of the review should ascertain the policy of the assigned Institute prior to the review, and ensure that members of the review committee adhere to that policy. To determine Institute policy, SRAs should contact the Institute's representative to the Extramural Program Management Committee (EPMC). The EPMC roster may be found at the following URL:
http://odoerdb2.od.nih.gov/cfdocs/comm./comm_oer_list.cfm.